

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing



Titin Ekowati¹, Susi Widjajani², Intan Puspitasari³, Endah Pri Ariningsih⁴,
Esti Margiyanti Utami⁵

^{1,2,3,4,5} Departement of Management, Faculty of Economic, Muhammadiyah University of Purworejo, Indonesia

ABSTRACT: Storytelling is a style of communication that employs a variety of elements in the form of a story or narrative. Compared to logical arguments, statistical data, and facts, storytelling is more credible. Wardah is one of the companies that has utilized marketing through visual storytelling in its advertising. In order to strengthen branding by connecting the company through values and emotions, this study aims to determine how Wardah cosmetic consumers perceive the visual aspects of storytelling marketing. In order to explore and examine the data, this study used a phenomenological design. According to the study's findings, all of the participants who used Wardah cosmetic products were able to comprehend the visual aspects of storytelling marketing, including design, personalization, usefulness, personality, storytelling, shareworthiness, real-time, and amplification. The findings also demonstrated that the ideals expressed in the visual content of the Wardah cosmetic advertising create an emotional bond among all study participants. The study's findings also revealed that every participant acknowledged that the visuals in the advertising gave the idea that Wardah was a halal cosmetic, which might have a favorable effect on the company's reputation.

KEYWORDS: Visual Storytelling Marketing, Brand Images, Wardah Cosmetics

I. INTRODUCTION

People will favor and trust stories more than brands, in theory. Consumers are more likely to spread the word about a company when there is an engaging backstory. Because of their ability to spread knowledge, stories are used by marketers as a type of storytelling in their advertising campaigns (Lowe, 2012).

Storytelling is a style of communication that employs a variety of elements in the form of a story or narrative. In detailing industrial processes, narrative marketing can be utilized to link a company's identity or philosophy (Salzermorling & Strannegard, 2004). Several areas of the human brain can be activated by narratives or stories (Simmons, 2006). A strong brand story will be more effective when it takes into account the moral or ethical concerns surrounding it (Matthews and Wacker, 2007). Honesty, authenticity, and believability are also essential components of storytelling.

Compared to logical reasoning, data, and facts, storytelling is more credible (Kaufman, 2003). People find it easier to appreciate the worth of stories that address a subject than simple advertisements since stories typically incorporate arguments in an approachable way. Individual stories, whether they are written, visual, or vocal, are the most potent types of narratives. If the story is positioned to focus on the lessons that can be learned, it will still be a good story even if it takes the shape of a failure (Bryan, 2011).

Advertising narratives include the brand inside plot components including objectives, acts, and conclusions (Escalas, 2004, p. 171). Because the advertising style has been conceptualized as identifying consumer characters and highlighting the part experiential characters play in the tale, it is known as narrative advertising (Boller & Olson, 1991). Because they can assume the roles of both the main character and the audience, customers can enjoy stories as an audience (Megehee & Woodside, 2010). Stories can be used by brands to increase recognition, care, awareness, comprehension, recall, and meaning (Singh & Sonnenburg, 2012, p. 189). Consumer and brand partnerships result when a brand supports the protagonist to achieve its objectives (Woodside, 2004).

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

In addition to being able to enter customers' cognitive processes and give daily life significance, stories may also be employed in marketing because of how consumers receive information when presented in a story style (Twitchell, 2004). Stories can tap into consumers' varied unconscious brand knowledge from episodic and implicit memory or procedural memory, much as other formats can tap into specific memory systems (Tulving, 1972) (Koll, Von Wallpach, & Kreuzer, 2010, p. 589).

Consumers often think in narrative terms rather than argumentative terms, particularly when attempting to convey the significance of an event (Escalas, 2004), according to prior study (Woodside et al., 2008). Numerous episodic stories that contain triggering episodes, experiences, consequences, or evaluations, summarized stories between individuals, or individuals' interactions with brands in certain situations, make up a large portion of the information that is kept in and retrieved from memory (Woodside, 2010, P.533).

According to Coker et al. (2017), visual storytelling commercials outperform direct sales video ads in terms of customer responses like brand perception, good word-of-mouth, sharing, and promotion. Another finding relates to how social media usage affects the way videos are executed.

Narrative-based commercials are more appealing than information-only ones, claim Hong et al. (2018). Direct marketing messages that exclusively aim to sell products, such those from broadcasters or business owners who offer data out of context, may raise suspicions in the public. Advertising that merely provides information often gets a better response from consumers who are not as invested in the brand.

Pan and Chen (2019) claim that storytelling marketing significantly affects brand perception, purchasing intention, and perceived quality. Businesses involved in ecotourism can utilize storytelling marketing to improve consumer perception of their brand, raise the perceived quality of their products, and encourage purchase intent.

Lunqvist et al. (2013) assert that storytelling has a significant influence on the experience of a client. The tales behind a brand can be used to create and strengthen positive brand associations. The impact of a brand story can affect how consumers respond to a brand.

Hong and Cho (2016) demonstrated how the subject of the tale has a significant impact on the brand story. Meanwhile, Moore (2011) carried extensive research and discovered that a brand's story can affect the storyteller in an advertisement.

Researchers like Coker et al. (2017), Hong et al. (2018), Pan and Chen (2019), Lunqvist et al. (2013), Hong and Cho (2016), and Moore (2011) have all performed studies on visual narrative marketing. These studies merely examine the relationship between factors; further analysis of how consumers react to visual storytelling marketing in a product commercial in terms of their experiences following viewing the visual content of the product advertisement has not been conducted by researchers. As a result of the data being derived from the phenomenon of participants' experiences of the visual content of a product commercial that they have seen, this study is able to more naturally and thoroughly explain the research variables.

The goal of this study is to determine how well Wardah cosmetic product consumers comprehend the elements of visual storytelling marketing in order to strengthen branding by connecting the brand to consumers' values and emotions.

Researchers chose the visual elements of Wardah beauty product commercials as their study's focus because, according to data from We Are Social, Indonesia has 191 million active social media users as of January 2022. Whatsapp has 88.7% of all social media users, making it the most popular platform. The next two apps are Instagram and Facebook, which account for 84.8% and 81.3% of all users, respectively. According to <https://dataindonesia.id>, users of Tik Tok and Telegram make up 63.1% and 62.8% of all users, respectively. According to information from www.instagram.com, Wardah has utilized Instagram as a digital promotion tool, and Wardah has the most official followers when compared to other cosmetic businesses.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

A. *Visual Storytelling Marketing*

Since ancient times, telling stories has been woven into the foundation of human civilization (Herskovitz & Crystal, 2010). In order to assist people understand and navigate the world, stories must be able to communicate ideas and impart wisdom (Mancuso & Stuth, 2014: 18). Stories are the result of people seeing the world in terms of causation (Hirschman, 2010, p. 581). According to Twitchell (2004, p. 484), stories are fictional works that have characters, narratives, points of view, and hidden meanings. According to Escalas (2004), p. 169, a story is a notion in narrative form that is organized into connected episodes with a beginning, middle, and finish.

Stories, according to Kakroo (2015), are simply facts wrapped in a compelling narrative to compel readers to act in favor of change. According to Adams (2014), the phenomenon is only loosely referred to as a "story" and the method of explaining the phenomenon is referred to as "narrative". In addition to contributing a point of view to a story, Landa & Onega (2014) define

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

"narrative" as a story narrated by a narrator. Companies always focus on the experience economy, but they also want to develop business models that can win over customers.

A story that may convey more "authenticity" than "expectation" can increase tension, claim Jeong & Koo (2015). In marketing communication, there is no difference between a brand narrative and a brand story. According to Kakroo (2015), the three essential elements of narrative are plot, character, and aesthetics.

Storytelling is a very powerful marketing strategy, but the stories used must be accurate and appropriate for the circumstance. Storytelling can be used to accomplish a variety of objectives, including inspiring action, sharing knowledge, minimizing biased information, pushing change, and guiding people into the future (Denning, 2004).

Storytelling as a branding technique connects the brand to values and emotions, gives the product authenticity and a sense of quality, and explains how the product or service differs from those of the competition (Kristenses, 2002). In the digital age, the connection between branding and narrative has grown stronger. On the internet, where information is freely shared, there is a significant exchange of viewpoints regarding businesses and their goods. Digital storytelling, or telling stories through digital technology, has become popular in this day and age. According to Alexander (2011), digital stories are narratives built on cyberculture.

With the potential to construct long-term advertising strategies, deepen brand knowledge, and foster emotional commitment to the brand, advertisements build a big story in a series. Advertising employs the art of storytelling in its most basic form, particularly when businesses are under pressure to stand out from the competition and offer customers a unique opportunity to interact with the actual product (Fog, Budtz, Munch & Blanchette, 2010).

Ads that appeal to the heart will have a better chance of changing people's minds than those that rely on reason or knowledge. According to research by the Advertising Research Foundation and the American Association of Advertising Agencies, concentrating on product positioning is less effective than communicating through branded tales or engaging customers through narrative. In contrast to traditional positioning methods, which rely on one-way communication, narrative-based advertising engages the target audience in a dialogue (Brandweek, 2007).

All brands that are successful in meeting marketing goals and building enduring brand equity agree that the brand with the best story wins. Through the use of framing, characters, cultural codes, and cultural preconceptions and expectations, advertising tells stories. A fragmented narrative style and immortalized occurrences are common in advertisements. Companies need to be creative to stand out, build compelling brand narratives, and maintain audiences' interest (Dahlen, Lange & Smith, 2010).

A narrative can be utilized even if it never truly occurred. In order to enhance a company's brand and convey credibility, it is permissible to fabricate stories in advertising. In order to be represented through storytelling, a real narrative need not involve an actual occurrence; rather, it should center on a significant life lesson that helps us understand how we feel about what happened. No matter how complicated a story is, it can all be boiled down to a governing idea—a phrase that captures the main point of the narrative. The proposition in an advertising brief and the controlling idea are essentially equivalent (Cordier, 2009).

The brand is the main character in a story that uses the firm, consumers, advertising, media, and research as supporting cast members to develop the brand personality. Every form of storytelling is an emotional, not a cerebral, experience. Brands will depend on inspiring and motivating storytelling in the future to move businesses. According to Jensen (1999; Delgadillo & Esealas (2004), storytelling marketing may be a powerful tool for both attracting and retaining customers, making it the most crucial component of brand development.

Content marketing on social media is one type of marketing that is currently popular. The concept of content marketing holds that in order to draw in and keep customers, organizations must think and behave like media companies. One type of content marketing is storytelling (Pulizzi, 2012). Contrary to advertising, which is typically spread around other people's content, content marketing involves the brand consistently producing valuable, relevant, and engaging content. This content is then used to influence customers or brand prospects to act favorably (Vollero & Palazzo, 2015).

Companies use visual storytelling to convey multimedia messages using digital intermediaries as a medium, concentrating on the strength of images and narratives. Design, personalization, platform usage, usefulness (measured by sharing, engaging, and purchasing), personality (measured by shared experience and easy to understand), storytelling (measured by brand product and relevancy), shareworthiness (measured by telling stories to others and sharing experiences for the brand), and real-time amplification are the dimensions of visual storytelling marketing that are discussed.

When it comes to visual marketing design elements, design may be summed up as "Embrace Visual Imagery," motivating how businesses produce great photos with the assistance of gifted photographers and artists. Without the use of text, things can be simply communicated through graphics, which can also add to the entire brand. For instance, the character in the story, the image's style (style), the color (tone) of the image, etc.

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

Personalization of content by platform, a major component of visual marketing, can be used to describe personalization. The days of displaying the same material on many platforms were long gone. Instead, social media leaders are embracing each platform's unique qualities and skills.

Each social media platform's strength can be perceived as valuable, and businesses take the initiative to make sure that their visual content serves a purpose as well. But personalization by itself doesn't necessarily result in helpful content. By identifying important topics and trends around which to develop visual content, social listening can help businesses become more valuable and relevant. Additionally, social listening can assist businesses in better understanding what motivates customers to take certain actions, such as sharing, engaging, or making a purchase.

Personality demonstrates that human-centric material performs better in visual marketing. To be human is to feel more like a friend than a business. A friend is someone who has personality, cherishes relationships, shares experiences, knows when to listen, be serious, and have fun, and who also values relationships. You can't start a sentence with "Buy this now." Companies need to consider how individuals discuss and suggest items or services to friends (share-experience) and how they should be simple to grasp, rather than directly selling on social media platforms.

A successful visual marketing strategy necessitates that the storytelling component of the material is just as vital as the use of graphics, as all the visual marketing examples to date demonstrate. Stories can originate from a variety of sources, including company values, how customers feel about your goods or services, significant anniversaries, or just by being timely and pertinent.

Producing material that is worthy of sharing is called shareworthiness. The general populace is both an audience and a storyteller. They are able to engage in the tales we generate (share experiences for the brand) and spread our stories to others. While putting an emphasis on real-time content, real-time amplification can create opportunities for real-time engagement and interaction.

Stories transform into an engine that propels brand value, distancing brands from ambiguous territory. Storytelling can serve as a long-term platform for a number of objectives, including product sales, knowledge expansion, and brand image enhancement. The audience must be able to understand the story's fundamental concept, which is its most crucial component. A tale can have a higher level of credibility if it contains excellent substance, a clear message, and is relevant to the target audience (Fog, Budtz, Munch & Blanchette, 2010).

B. Visual Storytelling Marketing and Brand Image

When consumers think about a specific brand, associations are stored in their memories (Roy & Banarjee, 2007). Therefore, a brand's image is a reflection of what consumers believe about a given brand. Consumers should be able to distinguish between a brand's value and quality and that of rival brands (Sallam, 2016).

In order to sway consumers' behavior toward a product, brand image must be a belief, value, and impression that distinguishes the product from others (Zhang, 2015). Brand image depicts a brand's memory structure, which includes consumer perceptions of its marketers' and product or brand manufacturers' traits, strengths, purposes, situations, and users. According to Cretu and Brodie (2007), brand image reveals what customers believe and feel when they hear or see a brand name.

According to Hogan (2005), a brand's image is an amalgamation of all the information that is already available about the targeted brand's products, services, and businesses. There are two ways to get this information. The first is via direct consumer experience, which includes both functional and emotional satisfaction. The second factor is how the company's opinions of the brand have been shaped via many types of communication, including advertising, promotions, public relations, logos, retail locations, employee attitudes toward serving customers and service quality.

Brand image is made up of objective or intrinsic qualities like the size of the box and the basic materials used, as well as the ideas, emotions, and associations that the product brand inspires. The basis of all perceptions people have of a brand are represented by its brand image. These impressions include: 1) Impressions about the product's physical attributes and performance; 2) Impressions about its functional benefits; 3) Impressions about the users of the product; 4) All emotions and associations triggered by the product; and 5) All imagery and symbolic meanings formed in consumers' minds, including images of human traits (Arnould et al., 2005: 120–122).

A product that has a positive brand image in the minds of its customers will increase its competitive advantage. A favourable brand image can help customers to distinguish and define differences among similar products, and further influence their selection intentions (Hsieh et al., 2004). A positive brand image occurs when customers associate themselves with a particular brand and have a positive attitude towards the brand. By having a positive image, the brand will become stronger, preferred, and unique (Kotler & Keller, 2006).

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

According to Bristow et al. (2002), the brand name becomes the primary factor in a consumer's choice of product if they believe there are differences between brands. Even customers use brands to establish or communicate their status (Escalas & Bettman, 2003; O'Cass & Frost, 2002). Additionally, brand names provide value to consumer perception and corporate profitability (Ataman and Ulengin, 2003). Brand familiarity has a considerable impact on online product purchases, according to Park and Stoel's 2005 research. Long-term sales history, a positive perception of a company's brand, and prior customer pleasure with the product all contribute to familiarity (Huang, Schrank, & Dubinsky, 2004).

Stories transform into the engine that propels brand value, distancing brands from ambiguous territory. Storytelling can serve as a long-term platform for a number of objectives, including product sales, knowledge expansion, and brand image enhancement. The audience must be able to understand the story's fundamental concept, which is its most crucial component. A tale can have a higher level of credibility if it contains excellent substance, a clear message, and is relevant to the target audience (Fog, Budtz, Munch & Blanchette, 2010).

Stories about companies, according to Robinson et al. (2012), aid in creating appealing brand narratives for consumers. He and colleagues (2016) also noted that stories act as a marketing strategy and the cornerstone for building brands. When skillfully promoted to customers or businesses, product images that are appropriate for the market may have an impact on purchasing decisions. Customers who are familiar with a positive product image will also have a better attitude toward the brand and be more inclined to make a purchase, according to Walsh et al. (2014).

According to Jung (2014), brand image plays a significant part in how consumers decide which products to buy since they will choose a brand that has a positive reputation. According to Stylidisa et al. (2015), brands with unique narratives can help them stand out in the minds of customers and even go on to become legendary brands that help build their reputations. According to Yang et al. (2014), the purpose of the product as well as the story's conveyance and narrative have a surprising impact on how customers view the product. According to Kent (2015), firms can improve positive brand perceptions by using authentic tales about brands as a communication approach with consumers. Additionally, Gilliam and Flaherty (2015) demonstrated how innovative stories can enhance brand loyalty and image by molding consumers to fit the brand.

Consumers of ecotourism may have a positive perception of a company when narrative is utilized in product ads, claim Pan and Chen (2019). The results of earlier studies also show that customers are more likely to recall unique brand tales. products included in uplifting stories may affect how consumers view those products, as the storyteller intended.

III. METHOD

A. Research Design

Phenomenological investigations are used in this study to investigate and analyze the data. Phenomenological research focuses on examining the essence or structure of experience within individual consciousness (Tuffour, 2017). This design can capture the phenomena experienced by individuals, can provide a deeper understanding of a phenomenon, the data is richer, more memorable, and natural (Ahyan et. al., 2016), and can describe the experiences of participants based on the phenomena experienced (Cresswell, 2013, p. 77).

Users of Wardah cosmetics and viewers of the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertising made up the study's subjects. based in the Indonesian city of Purworejo in Central Java. In order to collect the necessary data and information, researchers used 10 individuals. The participants are female Muhammadiyah Purworejo University students from Central Java, Indonesia, who range in age from 20 to 23.

B. Data Collection Details

By observing the phenomenon of visual storytelling marketing in "Wardah" cosmetic advertising and how it affects consumers' perceptions of themselves as Wardah cosmetic product users, researchers can directly gather data. In-depth interviews were also done with consumers, specifically Wardah cosmetic product users who had seen the visual content of the company's commercials and signed up for the study.

There are various metrics that can be used as a foundation for in-depth interviews, including design personalization, utility, personality, storytelling, shareworthiness, real-time and amplification. The characteristics of visual storytelling marketing are stated in terms of design, personalisation, usefulness, personality, narrative, shareworthiness, and real-time and amplification, according to Walter and Gioglio's opinion (2014, p.18).

C. Data Analysis

In order to keep the research's emphasis, the data analysis process in this study refers to data analysis that starts with a review of all available data from many sources before being reduced through abstraction, specifically by summarizing the core, process, and statements. The following step is to group it into units that are later classified or codified.

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

The data are then triangulated by the researcher. In this study, triangulation is used to test the validity and reliability of the data used by researchers. Specifically, data from observations or observations in the field are compared with interview data, the outcomes of observations or observations are compared with the research situation, and the circumstances and perspectives of participants are compared with data from other sources. Additionally, it employs triangulation with theory, which entails contrasting interview findings with multiple ideas pertinent to the study.

The final phase involves making a decision or verifying the information by drawing conclusions. In other words, the data analysis method in this study starts with a review of all the data, followed by the creation of a summary that is consistent with the research's main objective. The data are then organized according to categories, after which they are analyzed and conclusions are drawn.

IV. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

A. Abstraction Results

The results of in-depth interviews with 10 participants are reported in this study in accordance with each participant's perceptions of and comprehension of their experiences with the visual elements of Wardah cosmetic advertising. The findings from in-depth interviews are provided as abstractions that include the participants' justifications and experiences with the visual elements of Wardah cosmetic advertising.

B. Codification Results

The outcomes of the study codification can be expressed as follows based on the researchers' abstraction process:

Table 1. Wardah Cosmetic Users

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	User
Participant 2	User
Participant 3	User
Participant 4	User
Participant 5	User
Participant 6	User
Participant 7	User
Participant 8	User
Participant 9	User
Participant 10	User

Based on the table 1, it can be explained that all participants in this study were users of Wardah cosmetics.

Table 2. Have Seen the Visual Content of Wardah Cosmetics Ads

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	Have seen
Participant 2	Have seen
Participant 3	Have seen
Participant 4	Have seen
Participant 5	Have seen
Participant 6	Have seen
Participant 7	Have seen
Participant 8	Have seen
Participant 9	Have seen
Participant 10	Have seen

Table 2 explains why every participant in this study claimed to have seen the visual content of Wardah cosmetic commercials.

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

Table 3. Wardah Cosmetic Advertisement Content Visual Design

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	Interesting because attractive designs are easy to recognize
Participant 2	Attractive because the design is fresh, inspiring, motivating and trustworthy
Participant 3	It's interesting because the model has beautiful clean skin
Participant 4	All interesting because the appearance of advertising stars can be trusted
Participant 5	Interesting because of the attractive concept of a professional model
Participant 6	It's been interesting when I saw the ads
Participant 7	Interesting because of the nice design of the beautiful model
Participant 8	It's quite interesting because the pictures are clear, the colors are natural, the characters tell a detailed story about the product
Participant 9	Very interesting because the visual content is typical of credible figures
Participant 10	Interesting because it is natural, attractive design, and expresses a beauty

Table 3 shows that every participant in this study found the aesthetic attractiveness of the cosmetic advertising content created by Wardah to be pleasing. Only participants 8 and 9 concurred, calling it somewhat intriguing and highly intriguing, respectively.

Table 4. Wardah Cosmetic Advertising Visual Content Digital Platform

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	It's right through Youtube, Instagram, Tik Tok
Participant 2	Right via Youtube, Instagram
Participant 3	Already right through Instagram
Participant 4	It's right through Tv, Instagram
Participant 5	It's right through Tv, Instagram, tik tok
Participant 6	It's right through Youtube
Participant 7	It's right through social media
Participant 8	It's right through Youtube
Participant 9	It's been right through various media
Participant 10	It's right through social media

According to table 4, all survey participants agreed that the digital visual content platform used for Wardah cosmetic commercials was appropriate. This platform included a variety of channels, including YouTube, Instagram, Tik Tok, and TV.

Table 5. Benefits of Visual Content for Wardah Cosmetics Ads

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	Useful to know the latest product releases
Participant 2	Useful for the latest Wardah product information
Participant 3	Useful for getting usage information
Participant 4	Useful content for new product information
Participant 5	Useful for product details and buying references
Participant 6	Useful as a source of product information
Participant 7	Helpful to see lipstick colors and new variants of lipsticks
Participant 8	Useful for knowing the content and product information
Participant 9	Helpful in providing product information
Participant 10	Helpful for understanding product values

Table 5 makes it obvious that the study's participants thought the visual elements of the Wardah cosmetics advertisements were advantageous and provided them with a number of benefits as consumers.

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

Table 6. Personality Visual Content for Wardah Cosmetics Ads

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	Easy to understand and recommend to others
Participant 2	Easy to understand and recommend to friends
Participant 3	Easy to understand and recommend to friends
Participant 4	Easy to understand and recommend to friends, mother, sister
Participant 5	Less easy to understand because product advertisements cannot be tried directly
Participant 6	Easy to understand and recommendations to the closest people
Participant 7	Easy to understand and recommend to friends or relatives
Participant 8	Easy to understand and recommend to friends or relatives
Participant 9	Easy to understand because of the simple design there are no recommendations
Participant 10	Easy to understand and recommend to friends

Table 6 shows that nine participants in this study felt that the Wardah cosmetic advertising's visual personality was easy to understand and offered suggestions for other people. One participant complained that it was challenging to understand the visual content of the Wardah cosmetics commercial.

Table 7. Completeness of Stories in Visual Content for Wardah Cosmetics Ads

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	Incomplete, emotional story
Participant 2	Not very complete, touching emotions
Participant 3	It is complete and touching emotion
Participant 4	It's complete enough to arouse curiosity
Participant 5	Incomplete, less touching emotion
Participant 6	Very complete, providing products that suit your skin type
Participant 7	It's quite complete, touching emotions makes you happy
Participant 8	Quite complete and brings emotion
Participant 9	Tells the complete Wardah brand and can touch emotions directly
Participant 10	It is complete, emotionally creating a perfect beautiful meaning

Based on the table 7, it can be explained that 7 participants in this study stated that the story in the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements was complete or quite complete. There were 3 participants who stated that the story in the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements was incomplete.

Table 8. Appropriateness to be Shared with the Audience Visual Content for Wardah Cosmetics Ads

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	Worth sharing because the segmentation is according to the target market
Participant 2	It's worth sharing because it's interesting as a halal product
Participant 3	Appropriate, because it provides positive information
Participant 4	Worth sharing because positive information is polite delivery
Participant 5	No wonder because it doesn't violate the code of ethics and doesn't show anything obscene
Participant 6	Appropriate because the ad does not contain negative things
Participant 7	Worth sharing because the product is well known and halal
Participant 8	It's worth sharing because the ad is clear, polite, doesn't show anything inappropriate
Participant 9	Appropriate, make consumers feel owned and become part of the product
Participant 10	Appropriate, simple ads, natural, tells the daily life of women and beauty

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

According to Table 8, every participant in this study felt that the visuals in the Wardah cosmetic commercials should be made available to the public for a variety of reasons.

Table 9. Consumer Interaction and Engagement with the Wardah Brand

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	There is an attachment to the expectation of new information
Participant 2	There is an attachment because it is halal
Participant 3	There is an attachment of interest in new products
Participant 4	Yes, there is an attachment because it fits
Participant 5	Yes there is attachment and attraction
Participant 6	Yes there is an attachment, want to use
Participant 7	There is attachment, curiosity
Participant 8	Yes there is interaction and attachment
Participant 9	Yes, I feel I belong and become a part of Wardah
Participant 10	Yes there is interaction and attachment

According to table 9, every participant in this study asserted that customers communicated with one another and were loyal to the Wardah brand for a variety of reasons.

Table 10. Visual Content of Wardah Cosmetic Advertisements Creates the Impression of Halal Cosmetics

Participant	Participant Opinion
Participant 1	Impressed halal because of the content and character of the advertisement
Participant 2	It seems halal because the characters wear hijab
Participant 3	Impressed halal because of the appearance of Islamic ad stars
Participant 4	It seems halal because the advertising star wears a hijab
Participant 5	Impressed halal because of the hijab model
Participant 6	Impressed halal because of celebrity endorsement hijabers
Participant 7	It seems halal because the ad star wears a hijab
Participant 8	Impressed as halal because of the positive content, the advertisement star wears a hijab
Participant 9	It seems halal because the content conveys halal values
Participant 10	Impressed halal because it inspires beautiful and halal

Based on Table 10, it is clear that every participant in this study agreed that Wardah cosmetic commercials can provide the appearance of being for halal cosmetics.

C. Triangulation Results

Testing the validity and reliability of data (triangulation) used in this study is triangulation with sources and triangulation with theory. Triangulation with sources is done by comparing observational data or observations in the field with data from interviews and comparing the conditions and perspectives of participants with various opinions from previous researchers. Triangulation with theory is done by comparing interview data with various theories relevant to research (Guion, 2002).

Triangulation Results with Sources

Researchers compared the results of field observations and the results of interviews with participants (Carter et al., 2014). Based on the observations of researchers in the field, in general consumers who use Wardah cosmetic products have seen the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements. Based on the results of interviews conducted by researchers with participants, it was shown that all participants in this study were users of Wardah cosmetics and had seen the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements.

Based on the observations of researchers in the field, the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements really attracts consumers' attention. Based on the results of interviews conducted by researchers with participants, it was shown that all participants in this study stated that the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements attracted the attention of participants as consumers.

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

Observations made on the ground indicate that the digital visual content platform for the Wardah cosmetics advertising is suitable for use on many social media and television platforms. According to the findings of participant interviews done by researchers, every participant agreed that the digital platform for visual content utilized for Wardah cosmetic commercials was adequate. This included channels like YouTube, Instagram, Tik Tok, and TV.

According to on the ground observations, customers can learn a lot about products from the visual content of Wardah cosmetic commercials. The visual content of Wardah cosmetic commercials, according to the findings of participant interviews done by researchers, was beneficial and had a variety of advantages for participants as customers.

The personality of the Wardah cosmetics advertisements, according to observations made on the ground, is simple to grasp and motivates viewers to suggest the products to others. According to the findings of participant interviews, almost every participant in this study indicated that the personality of the visual content of advertising for Wardah cosmetics was easy to comprehend and that there were suggestions for other people. Consumers are very interested in and value products with a halal certification, according to real-world observations. The majority of the participants in this study asserted that the stories in the visual material of the Wardah cosmetic advertising were comprehensive or nearly complete, according to the findings of participant interviews conducted by researchers. The table above demonstrates that, for a variety of reasons, each participant in this study believed that the visuals used in the Wardah cosmetic promotion should be made available to the general public. Real world observations show that consumers are highly interested in and value products with a halal label. According to the results of participant interviews performed by researchers, the majority of the participants in this study claimed that the storylines in the visual material of the Wardah cosmetic advertising were entire or virtually complete.

It is appropriate, in light of observations made on the ground, to enlighten the public about the positive messages about beauty that are presented in the visuals of Wardah cosmetic advertising. Researchers' participant interviews revealed that every respondent concurred that the visual components of Wardah cosmetic advertising ought to be made available to the general public for a number of causes.

As Muslim consumers regularly utilize Wardah cosmetics, it has been observed in the field that the visual appeal of these commercials can encourage relationships and interactions between businesses and consumers. Every participant in this study indicated that customers interacted with and were attached to the Wardah brand for a variety of reasons, according to the results of participant interviews conducted by researchers.

Observations made in the field suggest that the appearance of the story characters in the Wardah cosmetic advertising may provide the impression that the items are halal. According to the results of participant interviews, every participant asserted that, for a number of reasons, the visual components of Wardah cosmetic advertising can provide the impression that they are halal cosmetics. The researcher also compared the results of the study with the opinions of previous researchers (Carter et al., 2014). Based on the study's findings, it can be explained that the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements has fulfilled aspects related to storytelling marketing, namely visual design, digital platforms, content benefits, personality content, content story or narrative, appropriateness to share with audiences, content can create interaction and engagement with consumers, as well as the impression you want to build from the content. While some of the results of previous studies only looked at the influence between variables, researchers have not further analyzed how consumers respond to visual storytelling marketing in advertising a product from their experience after seeing the visual content of the product advertisement. Previous research such as (Coker et al., 2017) showed the superiority of visual content of storytelling advertisements compared to direct sales video advertisements in several consumer responses such as attitudes towards brands, positive word of mouth, sharing, promotions, and seeing a brand. (Hong et al., 2018) explained that advertisements that use storytelling are more interesting than advertisements with pure information. According to (Pan & Chen, 2019), storytelling marketing has a considerable impact on brand perception, buying intent, and perceived quality. (Lundqvist et al., 2013) found the power of storytelling in a consumer's experience. (Hong, S.Y., & Cho, 2016) show that stories about a brand are strongly influenced by the subject of the story. Meanwhile, (Moore, 2011), conducted research which found that tinular speech about a brand can influence the storyteller in an advertisement.

Triangulation Results with Theory

Researchers also compared the interview results with theories (Carter et al., 2014) that are relevant to visual storytelling marketing. Based on the results of interviews with participants, it can be explained that all participants in this study who were consumers of Wardah cosmetic products stated that they had seen the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements, stated that the visual design of Wardah cosmetic advertising content was attractive for various reasons, stated that the digital platform used by Wardah as an advertisement had been appropriate, stated that the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements was useful, especially regarding product information, stated the personality of the visual content of the

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

advertisement was easy to understand and encouraged recommendations to others, stated that the story in the visual content of the advertisement was complete, stated that the visual content of the advertisement deserved to be shared with audiences, stated that the content visual advertisements can lead to interaction and attachment with consumers, stating that the impression created from the visual content of the advertisement is that Wardah is a halal cosmetic.

Some of the theories used as the basis of the research are described again in the following explanation, then they can be compared with the results of interviews conducted by researchers. Several theories about visual storytelling marketing put forward by several experts such as (Fog et al., 2010; Landa, J.A.G.& Onega, 2014; Matthews, R., & Wacker, 2007; Walter, K. & Gioglio, 2014) also showed the same thing with the results of the interviews. Visual storytelling is carried out by companies to convey multimedia messages using digital intermediaries as the medium by focusing on the power of visuals and stories. The dimensions of visual storytelling marketing are explained in terms of design as measured by style, tone, character; personalization which is measured by using the platform, usefulness which is measured by sharing, engaging, and purchasing; personality as measured by shared experience and easy to understand; storytelling as measured by brand product and relevance; shareworthiness as measured by share story to other and share experiences for the brand; and realtime amplification as measured by interaction and engagement (Walter, K. & Gioglio, 2014). Brand value is fueled by stories, which distinguish brands from the murky middle. Storytelling can serve as a long-term platform for a number of objectives, including product sales, knowledge expansion, and brand image reinforcement. The fundamental idea of a story must be simple enough for the audience to understand, which is the most crucial aspect of storytelling. A tale might have more credibility if it has great content, a clear message, and is pertinent to the audience (Fog et al., 2010). A solid brand narrative will be used more effectively when considering the moral or ethical issues surrounding it because honesty, authenticity, and credibility are also essential components of storytelling (Matthews, R., & Wacker, 2007). (Landa, J.A.G.& Onega, 2014) also consider that "narration" is an addition to the point of view in the story while narrative is the story told by the narrator.

The driving force behind brand value, stories set brands out from the murky waters. A long-term platform for several objectives, including product sales, knowledge expansion, and brand image reinforcement, can be formed by storytelling. The audience must be able to understand the story's fundamental concept, which is its most crucial component. A tale might have a higher level of credibility if it includes quality content, a compelling message, and is pertinent to the target audience (Fog et al., 2010). A strong brand story will be used more successfully if the moral or ethical concerns surrounding it are taken into consideration, as honesty, authenticity, and credibility are also essential components of storytelling (Matthews, R., & Wacker, 2007).

D. Verification Results

The study's findings revealed that all participants in this study who were consumers of Wardah's cosmetic products stated that they had seen the visual content of Wardah's cosmetic advertisements, stated that the visual design of Wardah's cosmetic advertising content was attractive for various reasons, stated that the digital platform used by Wardah as advertising was appropriate, stated the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements is especially useful for product information. In addition, all participants in this study also stated that the personality of the visual content of the advertisement was easy to understand and encouraged recommendations to others, stated that the story in the visual content of the advertisement was complete, stated that the visual content of the advertisement was appropriate for sharing with audiences, stated that the visual content of the advertisement could generate interaction and engagement with consumers, stating that the impression created from the visual content of the ad is Wardah as a halal cosmetic.

CONCLUSIONS

The findings of the study showed that all participants in this study who were consumers of Wardah's cosmetic products stated that they had seen the visual content of Wardah's cosmetic advertisements, stated that the visual design of Wardah's cosmetic advertising content was attractive for various reasons, stated that the digital platform used by Wardah as advertising was appropriate, stated the visual content of Wardah cosmetic advertisements is useful, especially regarding product information, states the personality of the visual content of the advertisement is easy to understand and encourages recommendations to others, states that the story in the visual content of the advertisement is complete, states that the visual content of the advertisement is worthy of being shared with audiences, states that the visual content of the advertisement can be causing interaction and engagement with consumers, stating that the impression created from the visual content of the ad is Wardah as a halal cosmetic. Based on the research conclusions, it can be put forward some practical implications for marketers or business people. It is very important for business people to understand that halal products will tend to be liked by consumers, especially Muslim consumers. So it is very important for companies to always create a halal brand image for their products to meet the

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

needs of the Muslim consumer market in Indonesia. Creating halal products can be done by creating products that contain halal values, have a halal label, show advertisements that contain halal information, and show the impression of being a halal brand.

Theoretical implications, the results of this study can strengthen the theory or thinking of (Walter, K. & Gioglio, 2014) which states that visual storytelling is carried out by companies to convey multimedia messages using digital intermediaries as the medium by focusing on the power of visuals and stories. The dimensions of visual storytelling marketing are explained in terms of design as measured by style, tone, character; personalization which is measured by using the platform, usefulness which is measured by sharing, engaging, and purchasing; personality as measured by shared experience and easy to understand; storytelling as measured by brand product and relevance; shareworthiness as measured by share story to other and share experiences for the brand; and realtime amplification as measured by interaction and engagement. Furthermore, it also strengthens the opinion of (Fog et al., 2010) which states that stories are the force that drives brand value, separating brands from the gray area. Storytelling can serve as a long-term platform for a number of objectives, including product sales, knowledge expansion, and brand image reinforcement. The fundamental idea of a story must be simple enough for the audience to understand, which is the most crucial aspect of storytelling. A tale might have a higher level of credibility if it contains excellent substance, a powerful message, and is relevant to the target audience. The results of this study further support (Matthews, R., & Wacker, 2007) assertion that honesty, authenticity, and credibility are essential components of storytelling and that a strong brand story will be employed more successfully when considering moral or ethical issues. In addition, the findings in this study are also in accordance with the opinion that (Landa, J.A.G. & Onega, 2014) also consider that "narration" is an addition to the point of view in the story, while narrative is the story told by the narrator. Implications for further research, the researcher recommends further research on the analysis of visual storytelling marketing using different research objects such as Oreo, Indomie, Ice Cream Walls and so on. The next researcher can also use research subjects for children consumers, because there are indications that these food and beverage products are liked by children consumers.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

We sincerely appreciate the financial assistance provided by LPPM Muhammadiyah University of Purworejo in the Indonesian province of Central Java. We also want to express our gratitude to everyone who contributed to the study, including the research participants.

REFERENCES

- 1) Adams, H. (2014). *Children's Literature*, in J. Fellowes & G. Oakley (Eds) *Language, Literacy and Early Childhood Education*, 2nd Edition, Melbourne, Australia: Oxford University Press. <https://ivypanda.com>
- 2) Ahyan, C., Domitran, Z., Radunovic, N.B., & Tavakoli, S.D. (2016). Phenomenology and Media Literacy, *The Turkish Online Journal of Design, Art, and Communication*, 6(2), 91-104. <https://doi.org/10.7456/10602100/003>
- 3) Alexander, B. (2011). *The New Digital Storytelling: Creating Narratives With New Media*. Publisher: Praeger. <https://www.researchgate.net>
- 4) Arnould, Price, & Zinkhan. (2005). *Consumers*. 2nd Edition. New York: McGraw-Hill. <https://www.scrip.org>
- 5) Ataman, B. & Ulengin, B. (2003). A Note on The Effect of Brand Image on Sales. *Journal of Product Brand Manage.* 12(4), 237-250. <https://doi.org/10.1108/10610420310485041>
- 6) Belch, G. E., & zBelch, M. A. (2015). *Advertising and promotion: An Integrated Marketing Communications Perspective*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill Education. <https://www.researchgate.net>
- 7) Berthon, P., Pitt, L., & DesAutels, P. (2011). Unveiling videos: Consumer-Generated ads as qualitative inquiry. *Psychology and Marketing*, 28 (10), 1044-1060. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20427>
- 8) Bower, A. B. (2001). Highly Attractive Models in Advertising and the Women Who Loathe Them: The Implications of Negative Affect for Spokesperson Effectiveness. *Journal of Advertising*, 30 (3), 51-63. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.2001.10673645>
- 9) Boller G. W., & Olson, J. C. (1991). Experiencing Ad meanings: Crucial aspects of narrative/Drama Processing. *Advances in Consumer Research*, 18, 164-171. <https://www.acrwebsite.org>
- 10) Bristow, D.N., Schneider, K.C. & Schuler, D.K. (2002). The Brands Dependence Scale: Measuring Consumers Use A Brand Name to Differentiate Among Product Alternative. *Journal of Product Brand Manage*, 11(6), 343-356. <https://doi.org/10.1108/10610420210445488>
- 11) Burton, J. L., McAlister, L., & Hoyer, W. D. (2015). How do Consumers Respond to Storylines in Television Advertisements? A Principal-Components Analysis Tool Helps Decipher Moment-to-Moment Evaluations. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 55 (1), 51-61. <https://doi.org/10.2501/JAR-55-1-051-061>

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

- 12) Carter, N., Lukosius, D.B., Dicenso, A., Blythe, J. & Neville, A.J. (2014). The Use of Triangulation in Qualitative Research. *Oncol Nurs Forum*. 41(5) : 545-547. <https://doi.org/10.1188/14.ONF.545-547>
- 13) Chen, Y., & Godes (2014). Rating with confidence: How rating scales affect future WOM behavior. *Advances in Consumer Research*, 42, 430-431. <http://www.acrwebsite.org/volumes/1017952/volumes/v42/NA-42>
- 14) Coker, K.K., Flight, R.L., & Baima, D.M. (2017). Skip It or View It: The Role of Video Storytelling in Social Media Marketing. *The Marketing Management Journal*. 27(2), 75-87. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/327755028>
- 15) Cooper, H., Schembri, S., & Miller, D. (2010). Brand-Self Identity Narratives in the James Bond Movies. *Psychology and Marketing*, 27 (6), 557-567. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20344>
- 16) Creswell, J. (2013). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*, 3rd ed., LOS Angeles : SAGE Publication. <https://www.scrip.org>
- 17) Cretu, A.E.& Brodie, R.J. (2007). The Influence of Brand Image and Company Reputation Where Manufacturers Market to Small Firms: A Customer Value Perspective. *Industrial Marketing Management*. 36(2),230-240. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indmarman.2005.08.013>
- 18) Delgadillo, Y., & Escalas, J. E. (2004). Narrative Word-of-Mouth Communication: Exploring Memory and Attitude Effects of Consumer Storytelling. *Advances in Consumer Research*, 31, 186-192. <https://www.researchgate.net>
- 19) Dening, S. (2004). Effective Storytelling: Strategic Business Narrative Techniques. *Strategy and Leadership*. 34(1), 42-48. <https://doi.org/10.1108/10878570610637885>
- 20) Escalas, J. E. (2004). Narrative Processing: Building Consumer Connections to Brands. *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, 14 (1&2), 168-180. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15327663jcp1401&2_19
- 21) Escalas, J.E. & Bettman, J.R. (2003). You Are What They Eat: The Influence of Reference Groups on Consumers Connections to Brands. *Journal of Consumer Psychology*. 13(3) ,339-348. https://doi.org/10.1207/S15327663JCP1303_14
- 22) Fog, K., Budtz, C., Munch, P., & Blanchette, S. (2010). *Storytelling: Branding in Practice*. Springer Berlin Heidelberg. <https://doi.org/10.1007/b138635>
- 23) Friestad, M., & Wright, P. (1994). The persuasion knowledge model: How people cope with persuasion attempts. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 21 (1), 1-31. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2489738>
- 24) Gilliam, D.A.& Flaherty, K.E. (2015). Storytelling by the Sales Forces and Its Effects on Buyers-Sellers Exchange. *Industrial Marketing Management*. 46, 132-142. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indmarman.2015.01.013>
- 25) Guion, Lisa A. (2002). Triangulation: Establishing the Validity of Qualitative Studies, Youth and Community Science, University of Florida, p.11-37.
- 26) He, H., Zhu, W. Gouran, D., & Kolo, O. (2016). Moral Identity Morality and Cause Related Marketing: The Moderating Effect of Brand Social Responsibility Image and Emotional Brand Attachment. *European Journal of Marketing*.50(1/2), 236-259. <https://doi.org/10.1108/EJM-102014-0613>
- 27) Herskovitz, S., & Crystal, M. (2010). The Essential Brand Persona: Storytelling and Branding. *Journal of Business Strategy*, 31 (3), 21-28. <https://doi.org/10.1108/02756661011036673>
- 28) Hsieh, M., Huei, P., Shan, L., & Setiono, R. (2004). Product-, Corporate-, and Country-Image Dimensions and Purchase Behavior: A Multicountry Analysis. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*. 32(3),251-270. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0092070304264262>
- 29) Hirschman, E. C. (2010). *Evolutionary Branding*. *Psychology and Marketing*, 27 (6), 568-583. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20345>
- 30) Hogan, S. (2005). *Employees and Image: Bringing Brand Image to a Life*. The 2nd Annual Strategic Public Relation Conference. Chicago: Lippincot Mercer.
- 31) Hong, S., Ae Kang, J., & Hubbart, G.T. (2018). The Effects of Founder's Storytelling Advertising. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship*. 22(3), 1-9. <https://doi.org/10.1002/cb.1793>
- 32) Hong, S.Y., & Cho, S.H. (2016). The Effect of Brand Storytelling Based on the Subject of Story. *The Journal of The Korea Contents Association*. 16(7), 112-121. <https://doi.org/10.5392/JKCA.2016.16.07.112>
- 33) Huang, W.Y., H. Schrank. and A.J. Dubinsky. (2004). Effect of Brand Name on Consumers Risk Perception of On line Shopping. *Journal of Consumer Behavior*. 4(1), 40-50. <https://doi.org/10.1002/cb.156>
- 34) Jensen, R.(1999). *The Dream Society: How the coming Shift from Information to Imagination Will Transform Your Business*, New York, McGraw-Hill
- 35) Judson, K. M., Devasagayam, P. R., & Buff, C. L. (2012). Self-Perceived Brand Relevance of and Satisfaction with Social Media. *Marketing Management Journal*, 22 (2), 131-144. <http://www.mmaglobal.org>

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

- 36) Jung, C.G. (2014). *The Structure and Dynamics of the Psyche*. 1stEdition. Vol.8. Routledge.
- 37) Kakroo, U. (2015). *5 Ways to Use Storytelling in Your Social Media Marketing*. Social Media Examiner. <https://www.socialmediaexaminer.com>
- 38) Kaufman, J.C. (2002). Narrative and Paradigmatic Thinking Styles in Creative Writing and Journalism Students. *The Journal of Creative Behavior*. 36(3), 201-219. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2162-6057.2002.tb01064.x>
- 39) Kent, L. (2015). The Power of Storytelling in Public Relation Introducing the 20 Master Plots. *Public Relation Review*.41(4), 480-489. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2015.05.011>
- 40) Koll, O., Von Wallpach, S., & Kreuzer, M. (2010). Multi-Method Research on Consumer Brand Associations: Comparing Free Associations, Storytelling, and Collages. *Psychology & Marketing*. 27 (6), 584-602. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20346>
- 41) Kotler, P. & Keller.K.L.(2006). *Marketing Management*, Twelfth Edition, Prentice Hall Person Education International.
- 42) Landa, J.A.G.& Onega, S. (2014). *Narratology: An Introduction*. London: Routledge
- 43) Lowe, S.(2012). Industrial Marketing Management. *IMP Research*. 41(4), 706-714. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.indmarman.2011.08.001>
- 44) Lundqvist, A., Liljander, V., Gummerus, J., & van Riel, A. (2013). The Impact of Storytelling on the Consumer Brand Experience: The Case of a Firm-Originated Story. *Journal on Brand Management*, 20 (4), 283-297. <https://doi.org/10.1057/bm.2012.15>
- 45) Mancuso, J., & Stuth, K. (2014). Storytelling and marketing: The Perfect Pairing? Sharing Your 'Brand Selfie' on Social Media. *Marketing Insights*, 26 (3), 18-19. <https://www.researchgate.net>
- 46) Matthews, R., & Wacker, W. (2007). *What's Your Story? Storytelling to Move Market, Audience, People, and Brands*. Indianapolis: FT Press. <https://www.amazon.com>
- 47) Megehee, C. M., & Woodside, A. G. (2010). Creating Visual Narrative Art for Decoding Stories that Consumers and Brands Tell. *Psychology and Marketing*, 27 (6), 603-622. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20347>
- 48) Mitchell, A. A., & Olson, J. C. (1981). Are Product Attribute Beliefs the Only Mediator of Advertising Effects on Brand Attitude? *Journal of Marketing Research*, 18 (3), 318-332. <https://doi.org/10.2307/3150973>
- 49) Moore, S.G. (2011). Somethings Are Better Left Unsaid: How Word of Mouth Influence the Storyteller. *Journal of Consumers Research*. 8(6), 1140-1154. <https://doi.org/10.1086/661891>
- 50) Mossberg, L., & Johansen, E.N. (2006) .Storytelling: Marketing in the Experience Industry. Goteborg. Studentlitterature. <https://www.semanticscholar.org>
- 51) Mossberg, L.(2008). Extraordinary Experiences through Storytelling. *Scandinavian Journal Hospitality and Tourism*. 8(3), 195-210. <https://doi.org/10.1080/150222508025324443>
- 52) O' Cass, A. & Frost, H. (2002). Status Brands: Examining the Effects of nonProduct Related Brand Associations on Status and Conspicuous Consumption. *Journal of Product Brand Manage*. 11(2), 67-88. <https://doi.org/10.1108/10610420210423455>
- 53) Pan, L.Y, & Chen, K.H. (2019). A Study on the Effect of Storytelling Marketing on Brand Image, Perceived Quality, and Purchase Intention in Ecotourism, *Ekoloji*. 28(107), 705-712. <http://ekolojidergisi.com>
- 54) Parent, M., Plangger, K., & Bal, A. (2011). The New WTP: Willingness to Participate. *Business Horizons*, 54 (3), 219-229. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bushor.2011.01.003>
- 55) Park, J., & Stoel, L. (2005). Effect of Brand Familiarity, Experience, and Informtion on Online Apparel Purchase. *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*. 33(2), 148-160. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09590550510581476>
- 56) Pera, R., & Viglia, G. (2016). Exploring How Video Digital Storytelling Builds Relationship Experiences. *Psychology & Marketing*, 33 (12), 1142-1150. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20951>
- 57) Pulizzi, J. (2012). The Rise of Storytelling as the New Marketing. *Publishing Research Quarterly*, 28 (2), 116-123. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12109-012-9264-5>
- 58) Reichheld, F. F. (2003). The One Number You Need to Grow. *Harvard Business Review*, 81 (12), 46-54. www.hbr.org
- 59) Robinson, S.R., Irmak, C., Jayachandran, S. (2012). Choice of Cause in Cause-Related Marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 76(4), 126-139. <https://doi.org/10.1509/jm.09.0589>
- 60) Roy, D., & Banarjee, S. (2007). Caring Strategy for Integration of Brand Identity with Brand Image. *International Journal of Commerce and Management*.17 (1/2)., 140-148. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/10569210710776512>.
- 61) Sallam, M.A. (2016). The Impact of Brand Image and Corporate Image and Corporate Branding on Consumer's Choice: The Role of Brand Equity. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*. 8(1), 98. <https://doi.org/10.5539/IJMS.V8N1P98>

Consumers of Indonesian Wardah Cosmetics are the Focus of an Analysis of Visual Storytelling Marketing

- 62) Salzer-Morling, M. & Strannegard, L. (2004). Silence of the Brands. *European Journal of Marketing*. 38(1/2), 224-238. <https://doi.org/10.1108/03090560410511203>
- 63) Schembri, S., Merrilees, B., & Kristiansen, S. (2010). Brand Consumption and Narrative of the Self. *Psychology and Marketing*, 27 (6), 623-637. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20348>
- 64) Simmons, J. (2006). Guinness and the Role of Strategic Storytelling. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*. 14(1), 11-18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09652540500369068>
- 65) Singh, S., & Sonnenburg, S. (2012). Brand performances in Social Media. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, 26 (4), 189-197. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intmar.2012.04.001>
- 66) Styliadis, K., Wickmana, C., & Soderberga, R. (2015). Defining Perceived Quality in the Automotive Industry: An Engineering Approach. *Procedia CIRP*. 36. 165-170. <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.PROCIR.2015.01.076>.
- 67) Tuffour, I. (2017). A Critical Overview of Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis: A Contemporary Qualitative Research Approach. *Journal of Healthcare Communications*, 2(4), 1-5. <https://doi.org/10.4172/2472-1654.100093>
- 68) Tulving, E. (1972). *Episodic and semantic memory*. In E. Tulving & W. Donaldson (Eds.), *Organization of memory* (pp. 381-403). New York, NY: Academic Press.
- 69) Twitchell, J. B. (2004). An English teacher looks at branding. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 31 (2), 484-489. <https://doi.org/10.1086/422125>
- 70) Vollero, A., & Palazzo. (2015). Conceptualizing Content Marketing: A Delphi Approach. *MERCATI & COMPETITIVITA*. 1(1), 25-44. <https://doi.org/10.3280/MC2015-001003>
- 71) Walsh, G., Shiu, E., & Hassan, L.M. (2014). Replicating Validating and Reducing the Length of the Consumer Perceived Value Scale. *Journal of Business Research*. 67(3). 260-267. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2013.05.012>
- 72) Walter, K. & Gioglio, J. (2014). *The Power of Visual Storytelling: How to Use Visuals, Videos, and Social Media to Market Your Brand*. McGraw Hill Professional.
- 73) Wentzel, P., Tomczak, T., & Herrmann, A. (2010). The Moderating Effect of Manipulative Intent and Cognitive Resources on the Evaluation of Narrative Ads. *Psychology and Marketing*, 5(5), 510-530. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20341>
- 74) Woodside, A. G. (2010). Brand-Consumer Storytelling Theory and Research: Introduction to a Psychology & Marketing Special Issue. *Psychology and Marketing*, 27 (6), 531-540. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20342>
- 75) Woodside, A. G., Sood, S., & Miller, K. E. (2008). When Consumers and Brands Talk: Storytelling Theory and Research in Psychology and Marketing. *Psychology and Marketing*, 25 (2), 97-145. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20203>
- 76) Yang, Y., Liu, X., Jing, F., Li, J. (2014). How Perceived Value Does Affects Travellers Satisfaction and Loyalty? *Social Behavior and Personality: An International Journal*. 42(10), 1733-1744. <https://doi.org/10.2224/sbp.2014.42.10.1733>
- 77) Yu, H., & Chang, Y. (2013). How to Influence the Brand Attitude of the Audience by Microfilms. *Journal of Promotion Management*, 19 (5), 674-686. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10496491.2013.839242>
- 78) Zhang, Y. (2015), the Impact of Brand Image on Consumer Behavior: A Literature Review. *Open Journal of Business and Management*. 03(01), 58-62. <https://doi.org/10.4236/ojbm.2015.31006>
<https://dataindonesia.id>. diakses tanggal 24 September 2022
www.instagram.com . diakses tanggal 24 September 2022



There is an Open Access article, distributed under the term of the Creative Commons Attribution – Non Commercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0 (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>)), which permits remixing, adapting and building upon the work for non-commercial use, provided the original work is properly cited.